Intavolatura Projects

Comparative Models: Editorial Policy

One of the unique features of Italian Keyboard Tablature is that its "identity" as a tablature notation is based on the adherence to a set of conventions. Italian Keyboard Tablature *looks* like modern keyboard notation (or at least an antiquated version of modern notation), with the use of two staves and familiar note signs, but it *behaves* like a figure-based tablature such as German organ tablature or Italian lute tablature, in that it presents the music in a way that makes it as easy as possible to play while at the same time hiding its structural details. To give just one example, the contour of polyphonic parts are hidden due to the fact that the stem directions of notes are dictated by their vertical placement in the staff at any given moment (that is, whatever note is highest in a staff line gets an upward stem, and so forth). In fact, all of the notational irregularities in Italian keyboard tablature have the same effect, working to hide polyphonic structure in favor of playability. [1]

The accurate transmission of specific notational and typographical details is therefore key to an understanding of music notated in Italian keyboard tablature. At the same time, the inclusion of every notational irregularity in a source – such as the irregular slanting of stems – can lead to modern scores that are aesthetically unpleasing and difficult to play and study. Therefore, I've sought a "middle ground," creating readable and playable editions while attempting to include as many notational details as deemed feasible. The user of this site is reminded that, ultimately, no transcription into modern notation, no matter how accurate, can fully replace a consultation of the original source material. In the future, I hope to include comparative models that either include scans of the original sources or *are* simply scans of the original sources.

Short Descriptions of Sources for the Intabulations in the Comparative Models:

Bardini Codex (I-Fmba Florence, Museo Bardini Ms. 967).

The **Bardini Codex** is a large collection of intabulations of vocal music – eighty-two in total. The manuscript was described in full by Craig Monson.[2] Monson argues that the manuscript was

---

1   Please see Alexander Silbiger's article "Is the Italian *intavolatura* a tablature?," or Chapter 1 of my dissertation, for more specific information on IKT's conventions. Alexander Silbiger, "Is the Italian *invatolatura* a tablature?," *Rercercare 3* (1991): 81-103. Ian Pritchard, *Keyboard Thinking: Intersections of Notation, Composition, Improvisation, and Intabulation in Sixteenth-Century Italy* (PhD Diss.: University of Southern California, 2018); see especially Chapter 1, pp. 65-146.

2 Craig Monson, "Elena Malvezzi's Keyboard Manuscript: A New Sixteenth Century Source," *Early Music History* 9 (1990): 73-128

commissioned or possibly even made by Elena Malvezzi, a late sixteenth-century Bolognese nun. If so, Sr. Elena was the only scribe.

The repertoire is entirely of vocal music from the second half of the sixteenth century (much of it identified but not all); notable are several intabulations of madrigals and chansons by Rore from his first books of four- and five-voiced madrigals. These include the famous madrigal "Alla dolce ombra" and the "Ferrarese" chanson "En voz adieu-Hellas comment"; the latter exists in other intabulations and arrangements in the sixteenth century.

The Bardini manuscript contains several interesting elements with regard to performance practice. Many of the vocal works that were originally composed with *chiavette* are transposed down a fourth or a fifth.[3] This – in addition to a few intabulations with song texts – might indicate that the intabulations here were intended for vocal accompaniment; this manuscript is therefore of interest to those studying Renaissance accompaniment and early continuo performance practices.

In line with this accompaniment "ideal" (or, at least present-day ideals of early accompaniment!), the intabulations in Bardini tend not to be filled with elaborate *passaggi*. The intabulations generally follow Italian Keyboard Tablature conventions[4], although they also tend to largely adhere to the original polyphony of their models (in general, more elaborate and soloistic intabulations, such as those by Gabrieli or Merulo or those in the Layolle manuscript, tend to rework the polyphonic structures of their models).

One last thing to note about Bardini is the use of dots for accidentals. This was commonly seen in earlier printed volumes in Italian Keyboard Tablature, such as the 1523 *Recercari* of Marc'Antonio Cavazzoni or the two volumes (1543/c.1543) by his son Girolamo. Here, however, the dots are not used consistently with the key signature; sometimes they seem to "reinforce" a flat in the signature, and other times they seem to go against it. This points to the fact that Italian keyboard tablature is unfortunately not as definitive with regard to accidental usage, at least compared to other tablatures such as Italian lute tablature.

Bertoldo *Canzoni francese intavolate per sonar d'organo* (Venice: Vincenti, 1591). **Bertoldo1591a**

Bertoldo *Toccate, Ricercari et Canzoni francese intavolate per sonar d'organo* (Venice: Vincenti, 1591). **Bertoldo1591b**

Many of the volumes of printed keyboard music from the late sixteenth century are posthumous and, perhaps fair to say, "retrospective" collections. The two volumes of printed intabulations of Sperindio Bertoldo were printed more than twenty years after the composer's death. Intabulations are featured prominently in both collections: the first volume of *canzoni francese* (**Bertoldo1591a**) is comprised of intabulations of four well-known vocal works, all of which were popular for lute and keyboard intabulations, and the second volume (**Bertoldo1591b**) consists of two abridged and intabulated (and unattributed!) ricercars from Annibale Padvoano's 1551 collection of part-book ricercars.[5]

---

3 See Ibid., 100

4 See Note 1 above.

5 Annibale Padovano, *Il primo libro de ricercari a quattro voci* (Venice: Gardano, 1556).

On the title page of the first collection (**Bertoldo1591a**) the publisher, Giacomo Vincenti, indicates that the two Bertoldo volumes represent the beginning of a large-scale project of printed volumes in IKT, which would have included works by Merulo, Gabrieli, and Guami. Obviously this series never panned out, at least not in the way that Gardano's "collection" of keyboard works did (which included all of Gabrieli's keyboard music and three books of Merulo's *canzoni*).

The Bertoldo intabulations tend to be more elaborate in terms of diminution, and in terms of the intabulator's willingness to rework the polyphony of the model or to "replace" vocal polyphony with idiomatic keyboard writing.

Castell'Arquato (I-CARcc Castell'Arquato, Archivio della Chiesa collegiata).

The large collection of keyboard music in the Castell'Arquato manuscripts – found in the archive of the Chiesa Collegiata in Castell'Arquato, a small town near Piacenza –is notable for containing a wealth of keyboard music and, ironically, for its difficulty in accessibility. In making my transcriptions, I was working with microfilms held at the Hargrove Library in Berkeley, and facsimile copies originally made by Oscar Mischiati (I remain indebted to the late and brilliant Liuwe Tamminga for supplying me with Professor Mischiati's materials for this project). Not only are the Castell'Arquato manuscripts difficult to access, they are also in severely deteriorating condition.

This is an unfortunate situation, as they are an incredible wealth of information on the art of intabulation. They include several intabulations of vocal works in addition to several intabulations of part-book canzoni from Florentio Maschera's 1584 collection[6]; the intabulations in the collection are from different scribes, offering a window on the relationship between scribal habit and the conventions of Italian keyboard tablature. Many of the intabulations, including that of Arcadelt's madrigal *Se per colpa*, included on this website, seem to be sketches that offer a tantalizing glimpse at the intabulation process itself.

As mentioned above, the pieces in Castell'Arquato are in the hands of multiple scribes. Of the music transcribed for this website at this point, three intabulator/scribes are represented: "Intabulator A" made the intabulations of the Maschera canzoni and the fragment of "Ancor che col partire" (and other vocal works, not yet included here); "Intabulator B" made the intabulation of "O felici occhi miei" (Arcadelt), and "Intabulator C" "Se per colpa" (Arcadelt) and the fragment of "Or vien ça vien*"* (Janequin). It is important to note that H. Colin Slim sees this last intabulator as likely being the organist-composer Claudio Veggio, whose important ricercari are also found in the collection.[7]

Andrea Gabrieli *Il terzo libro de ricercari..* (Venice: Gardano, 1596). **Gabrieli1596**

Andrea Gabrieli *Canzoni alla Francese… libro quinto* (Venice: Gardano, 1605). **Gabrieli1605a**

Andrea Gabrieli, *Canzoni alla Francese… Libro Sesto & ultim*o (Venice: Gardano, 1605). **Gabrieli1605b**

---

6 Florentio Maschera, *Libro primo de canzoni da sonare* (Brescia: Sabbio, 1584).
7   H. Colin Slim, ed. *Keyboard Music at Castell'Arquato* CEKM 37 (Middleton, WI: American Institute of Musicology, 2005), 3:X.

Andrea Gabrieli is certainly the most well-known intabulator-composer included on the site at this point. His six extant volumes of published keyboard music, published between 1593 and 1605, contain a large number of intabulations. Notably, all of Andrea's volumes were published posthumously, and it has long been assumed under the oversight (and presumably editorship) of his famous nephew Giovanni Gabrieli. (If so, did editing keyboard music also involve intabulating it?) The series also represents a large-scale project by the Gardano publishing house. Notably, in the volumes dedicated exclusively or almost exclusively to intabulated vocal music (**Gabrieli1605a**, **Gabrieli1605b**) Andrea's name is prominently featured as **intabulator**. In my recent PhD dissertation, I argued that Andrea's role as intabulator can be considered as a form of early modern "authorship."[8]

Although it is not uncommon to see references to Andrea's intabuations as being less elaborate (and, by implication, more "pedestrian" or less artful than, say, Claudio Merulo's), they are actually incredibly attractive solo keyboard works and fascinating windows on the intabulation process. They offer a veritable range of approach, from being highly elaborate and free in their treatment of the model's polyphony, to being quite conservative in terms of ornamentation and in their *fidelity* to the polyphonic structures of their models. This latter consideration is an important one in assessing intabulations; in my dissertation I argued that Gabrieli's intabulation of Lasso's ubiquitous *Susanne un jour* represents a case of intabulation-as-*partitura*.

Layolle Codex (I-Fl Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana Ms. Acquisti e Doni 641).

Like the Bardini manuscript, the Layolle manuscript – a fragment of the original title page reads INTAVOLATURA DI M. ALAMANO AIOLLI – is entirely dedicated to intabulations of vocal works. This manuscript was described in an article by Frank D'Accone.[9] D'Accone confirmed that one of the two scribes of the manuscript was the Florentine organist and composer Alamanne de Layolle (D'Accone speculates that the other scribe might have been Alamanne's son). The manuscript contains intabulations of sixteen vocal works, many of them "top ten hits" of the sixteenth century, such as "La guerre" (Janequin), "Susanne un jour" (Lassus), and "Nasce la pena mia" (Striggio). The manuscript also contains arrangements of pieces from the sixth *intermedio* from the famous 1589 Florentine intermedii (*La Pellagrina*); these arrangements would be of particular interest to students of basso continuo.

Many of the intabulations in the Layolle manuscript are quite elaborate, including that of "Nasce le pena mia." This particular setting is a perfect example of the "madrigal-to-toccata" role that elaborate intabulations seem to to have.[10] In particular, Layolle (and his son?) seem to enjoy adding ornamental "super-structures" over the model's polyphony; the passaggi often contain motives that are developed and/or treated using polyphonic devices. Some of the specific figuration even seems evocative of the Neapolitan/Macque school.

---

8   Pritchard, *Keyboard Thinking*, 224-311.

9 D'Accone, Frank. "The 'Intavolatura di M. Alamanno Aiolli': A Newly Discovered Source of Florentine Renaissance Keyboard Music." *Musica Disciplina* 20 (1966): 151-174.Alexander Silbiger,

10   That is, the notion that elaborate intabulations of vocal works were direct influences on the development of the mature keyboard toccata of composers such as Merulo and Frescobaldi. See Alexander Silbiger, "From Madrigal to Toccata: Frescobaldi and the *Seconda Prattica,*" in *Critica Musica: Essays in Honor of Paul Brainard*, ed. John Knowles (Amsterdam, Netherlands: Gordon and Breach, 1996): 403-28.

Of particular interest in this manuscript is the use of signs – visually similar to *custos* signs – that indicate when one of the polypohonic voices of the model moves from the top staff to the bottom in the tablature and vice versa. The signs undermine, in a sense, the action of Italian keyboard tablature, which, as described in the main notes, *obscures* the movement of the model's polyphony through practices such as stem direction, the prescriptive nature of the staves, and the like. The *custos* signs "push against" these tendencies to clarify the voice leading of the models.

Naples 48 (I-Nc Naples, Biblioteca del Conservatorio di Musica S. Pietro a Majella, Ms. Mus. str. 48).

This manuscript, held by the library of the Conservatory S. Pietro a Majella in Naples, is a Neapolitan anthology of keyboard music. Alexander Silbiger dates it from 1600 or even later, and it largely consists of canzoni, toccatas, and other "free" works (free in the sense of not being overtly based on pre-existing polyphonic/vocal models).[11] The composers represented are largely from the Neapolitan/Macque school, but there is also a toccata by Merulo (copied from Diruta's organ treatise *Il Transilvano*) and a canzona by Ercole Pasquini that appears in several other sources. Of interest to the current project are two intabulations of well-known vocal *chansons*; again, these are "top ten hits" of the sixteenth century: Crecquillon's "Un gai bergier" and Godard's "Ce mois de mai." Both appear to be in the same hand (the manuscript was written by two scribes). "Un gai bergier" is entitled "La Lanza" (perhaps after a line in the song's text,"car tu na pas la lance, la lance.."). These intabulations are quite elaborate, both in the sense of the amount of diminution used, and in the extent to which the intabulator rearranges the polyphonic structures of their models. Both intabulations largely adhere to the conventions of Italian keyboard tablature. The manuscript also contains intabulations of some Trabaci *versetti* (not yet included on the website).

Editorial Policies

An understanding of Italian keyboard tablature and its functioning is predicated on the accurate portrayal of many of its notational irregularities. Because of this, the transcriptions featured were made with this ideal in mind. However, at the end of the day they are, in fact, *transcriptions* into modern notation, and some changes were made to improve comprehensibility for the modern reader and player. Again, the user of the site is urged to consult facsimiles of the original sources (which I hope to include in the very near future.)

Each comparative model includes its own set of **critical notes**. I have tried to keep changes to a minimum, but I have corrected obvious errors (details of which can be found in the critical notes). In some small instances in which the sources were only partly readable, I reconstructed the intabulation using the model. Having said that, I have sought to keep this practice to a minimum: fragments were not completed, and larger sections that were entirely unreadable were left untouched.

---

11   Alexander Silbiger, *Italian Manuscript Sources of 17th Century Keyboard Music* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1980).

Here are the specific editorial policies that were adopted:

Noteheads:

- Noteheads have been transcribed into modern shapes. (I am using Finale 2019 for engraving.) At an earlier stage in this project I experimented with trying to replicate Gardano's noteheads; the fruits of this experiment can be seen in the model for Bertoldo's *Frais et galliard* intabulation. In the end, I found the result visually unsatisfying (given the limitations of Finale), and abandoned the idea.
- Noteheads and shapes that are not common to modern notation have been reproduced faithfully.
- All original note values have been maintained.

Stems:

- Original stem directions have been strictly maintained, as they are key to an understanding of Italian keyboard tablature's "tablature" identity (see above).
- Stem lengths have been faithfully transcribed.
- Double-stemmed notes – and single stem notes that *would* be double-stem notes in modern practice -- have been transcribed faithfully.
- In the manuscript sources, the angle at which note stems slant might be seen as significant, in that series of slanted stems possibly suggest the contour of a distinct voice in the tablature. This practice is not observed consistently, however, and due to the difficulties of replicating stem directions in Finale in an aesthetically pleasing manner, I ultimately chose *not* to attempt to include these in the transcription. Having said that, the user is once again urged to consult the original source.

Rests:

- All rests from the original sources were included.
- The precise horizontal placement of rests – which were often used in Italian tablature to indicate the entrance of a particular voice – were maintained.

Beams:

- Beaming has been transcribed as accurately as possible. Some manuscript intabulations (e.g. "Nasce la pena mia" in the Layolle manuscript) show irregular beaming that could indicate phrasing. This irregular beaming has been maintained.
- As volumes of keyboard music made using single-impression printing (e.g. those of Bertoldo and Gabrieli) did **not** include beams, my transcriptions do not either. Although somewhat unorthodox with regard to modern practice, I did not want to "impose" beaming on these sources, given the general potential for beams to suggest phrasing in Italian keyboard intabulations.

Vertical Alignment:

- The alignment of notes in the staff is potentially an important element in assessing the "tablatureness" of a given source– it seems as if many publishers and scribes of music in Italian Keyboard Tablature sought to align the various parts vertically, thus increasing the immediate comprehensibility to the player or reader.[12] This would match the ideal of the "ready to play" aspect of tablature notation generally. It is important to note that this ideal is **not** always met, however; many sources either fail to maintain consistent vertical alignment or seem to ignore it all together.[13] At the initial stages of this project I experimented with attempting to accurately transcribe vertical offset between parts, but the end result was a score that was difficult to read and messy in appearance. Therefore, I ultimately decided to conform with modern practice in allowing Finale to automatically align notes. Once again, the user is strongly encouraged to consult the original source material.

Accidentals:
- All accidentals have been maintained, except for those that are obvious errors. All changes to the original musical text, including the correction of potentially erroneous accidentals, have been included in the critical notes.
- Editorial accidentals are put in parentheses.

Clefs/Key Signature/Mensuration Signs:

- All of the music has been transcribed into modern clefs and standard five-line keyboard notation, for ease of reading and playing.
- All original key signatures, note values, and mensuration signs have been maintained.

Disposition of Parts:

- The disposition of parts between the two staves have been strictly maintained.

Transcriptions of Models:

- I have adopted a completely different set of editorial standards for the transcriptions of vocal and instrumental polyphony – the models upon which the intabulations are based. As my focus here is on the intabulations, not the models, I have simply provided "rough" transcriptions. I should stress that the scores of the models are **not** intended to be used for anything beyond a comparison with the intabulation; in most cases, there are modern scholarly editions readily available at music libraries or good (or at least serviceable!) performance editions online at sites such as imslp.org and choralwiki.org.
- The specific source for each model is listed on the title page of each transcription.
- The text for vocal pieces has been transcribed faithfully – with only the occasional change when alternate spellings were found between part books from the same set.
- The reader is urged to remember that differences in the musical text between intabulations and models could be the result of the intabulator working with a different source than the one I used for the comparative model; I have not conducted any research as to the *specific* version or

---

12 See Silbiger, *"Intavolatura,"* 97.
13 For example, the reader is invited to attempt to sight-read Antico's 1517 *Frottole* or Gabrieli's 1595 *Ricercari*!

edition of the model an intabulator may have used for each intabulation, as (a) this is often impossible (especially if the work was reprinted many times, or copied into multiple anthologies, etc.), and (b) musical-textual deviations are typically small and not significant for an understanding of the intabulation, performance, and compositional processes that ultimately form the *raison d'etre* of the present project.